Contradiction Of Using *Hujjah* With Daif Hadith In *Fadail A'mal*:
Analysis of the Book of *Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib*

Rafiqatul Anisah¹, Abdillah Afabih²*
Ma’had Aly Hasyim Asy’ari Tebuireng
Email: anisahrafiqa@gmail.com¹, abdillah@tebuireng.ac.id²

*corresponding author

Abstract

Scholars of hadith have mentioned that da’if (weak) hadiths can be used for Fadail Al-A’mal (virtuous actions), but it is uncertain which type of da’if hadith can be used as evidence. Although previous researchers have conducted numerous studies on this topic, this paper aims to discuss the validity of using da’if hadiths as evidence for Fadail al-a’mal by examining the types, conditions, and replacement hadiths of da’if narrations. The conclusions presented in this paper are based on the opinions of hadith scholars, taking into account both the advantages and disadvantages. The researcher employs an analytical study method, focusing on the da’if hadiths compiled in the book “Targhib wa At-Tarhib” in the chapter on Thaharah (purification). The findings of this study indicate that Syadid al-da’ifi refers to a category of hadith that cannot be rectified. Within the Thaharah chapter of the Kitab At-Targhib and At-Tarhib, there are 118 hadiths categorized as follows: 43 authentic hadiths, 16 hasan (good) traditions, 7 da’if traditions, and 52 traditions for which al-Hafizh al-Mundhiri (the author of the book) does not mention their authenticity. Researchers have attempted to identify da’if hadith substitutes to remove the prohibition on using da’if hadiths as evidence for Fadail Al-A’mal. Consequently, out of the seven hadiths, five da’if hadiths can be replaced. The first, third, fourth, and sixth hadiths, however, do not require replacement as they are not weak.

Keywords: *Hujjah, Daif Hadith, Fadail al-A’mal, Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib*
Contradiction Of Using Hujjah With Daif Hadith In Faḍail A’mal: Analysis of the Book of Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib

Abstrak


Kata Kunci: Hujjah, Hadis Daif, Faḍail al-a’mal, Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib

Introduction

Hadith is the second source of Islamic law; it is essential to understand it well so that we can practice it well, too; as we all know that in general, based on its quality, hadith is divided into three; Sahih, Ḥasan, and daif. Sahih hadith is at the highest level, followed by Ḥasan hadith, while daif hadith is at the lowest level. These three categories of hadiths can be used for hujjah. There is no debate or difference between the scholars in interpreting authentic hadiths and Ḥasan hadiths. However, not in the weak hadith. There are still pros and cons in hujjah using daif hadith.

The study of weak hadiths, as proposed by Syahrul, still raises many issues and is widely questioned in society. Moreover, the application of criteria for weak hadiths that can be practiced or not practiced in the realm of virtuous deeds has not been widely undertaken. Various studies addressing this topic are still limited to

Contradiction Of Using Hujjah With Daif Hadith In Fadail A’mal: Analysis of the Book of Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib

Rafiqatul Anisah, Abdillah Afabih

theoretical discussions and have not been applied in specific books. For example, an article written by Maulana Nur Kholis has not yet applied the practice of weak hadiths mentioned in the book. He presents various types of weak hadiths and the reasons for their permissibility to be practiced, along with their conditions, without applying them in a specific book. This non-applicative study of weak hadiths is not the only one circulating.² The study of daif hadiths written by Moh. Muafi is also similar. He presents the opinions of scholars regarding the practice of weak hadiths in virtuous deeds and their influence on worship, without including their application in a book.³

In contrast to what has been written by previous researchers, the author wants to explore the criteria of daif hadiths that can be practiced and used as evidence that focuses on the study of one book. The author will examine the hadiths in the book Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib specifically in the Taharah chapter. As we all know, a daif hadith can be used for fadail al-a’mal without knowing the types, what the conditions are, and whether there is a replacement hadith if the scholars prohibit the daif hadith. Then the author includes an explanation for each daif hadith found accompanied by a replacement hadith based on the opinions of the scholars, both cons and pros.

The book Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib, the focus of research in this paper, is the book by a hadith scholar named Imam Al-Hafiẓ Zakiyuddin Abdul Al’Azim bin Abdul Qowi Al-Mundziri, a Syam national who later moved to Egypt.⁴

Kitab Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib is a book that talks explicitly about God’s recommendations and promises to humankind who obey Him and people who disobey by violating His commands and threats. The contents

---
of the entire discussion of the book do not necessarily talk specifically about education, but this book is composed of several different chapters. In writing this book, Hafiż al-Mundzir tries to explain to Muslims how important it is to worship following the provisions contained in the hadith so that worship becomes an orderly worship and can change and influence the behavior of Muslims in everyday life. For this reason, in this context, Hafiż al-Mundzir explains the virtues of an act by rewarding those who carry it out obediently and giving punishments for those who violate the rules set by the Shari'a.

This book consists of the Prophet SAW's hadiths regarding the things a Muslim deserves and should practice and the pleasing consequences. This kind of hadith is included in the targib category. On the other hand, this book also contains hadiths about things that Muslims should avoid and the consequences if done. This kind is included in the tarhib category. Based on a further review of the title of this thesis, it is essential to know previous research related to this research, both theoretically and scientifically. The following are some previous studies that discuss the opinions of hadith scholars in arguing with daif hadiths for faḍail al-ʿamal.

It is undeniable that this discussion is not something new. Several previous studies have explained the blasphemy of daif hadith for faḍail al-ʿamal. Most of these studies focus on the argument for faḍail al-ʿamal without explaining its types, conditions, and replacement hadiths. Whereas in this study, the authors focused more on the daif hadith contained in the book Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib specifically in the taharah chapter. In addition, the author completes various kinds of daif hadiths and the conditions, including replacement hadiths and takhrij.

In today's era, a new group has emerged who claim to be sunnah experts, but they need to understand sunnah. They only learn from books.

---

Contradiction Of Using Hujjah With Daif Hadith In Fadail A’mal: Analysis of the Book of Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib

and never sit beside the teachers. They don’t have a muttassil scientific chain of reference to the Prophet; their hobby is to invalidate hadiths, like to bid’ah practice, even disbelieve others, and reject taqlid, but instead, they follow their scholars like to judge Sahih and daif a hadith according to their desires. This group believes that daif hadiths must be dismissed and cannot be practiced; only Sahih and Hasan hadiths can be practiced. Of course, this assumption contradicts the views of hadith scholars and fiqh scholars.6

Therefore, this research was conducted to analyze, study and examine the law on practicing daif hadiths in Fadail al-a’mal (Al-A’mal virtues), accompanied by various kinds of daif hadiths contained in the book Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib chapter taharah, and also equipped with maqbul hadiths as a replacement for these daif hadiths.

The theoretical framework in this paper contains some discussion.

Among others are the meaning of daif hadiths, the types of hadiths of daif, and the opinion of scholars about bashing against daif hadiths. This paper also contains the permissibility of arguing with daif hadiths, the conditions for argumentation of daif hadiths, and the prevention of attacking against daif hadiths.

This research was written using the library research method, which is analytical through an approach that focuses on the book Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib chapter taharah. The author collects the hadiths of the daif contained in the book. The author manages them based on the various hadiths of the daif; after that, the author does the takhrij step and seeks some alternative hadith from the book Sahih Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib by Sheikh Albani.

Two Types of Daif hadith

The daif hadith cannot be practiced when the status of this daif is classified as severe or known as Syadid da’fi. However, when the level of daif is mild, the degree can rise to Hasan li gairihi and even Sahih li gairihi, so that it can be practiced.

6 Maulana et al., “Hukum Mengamalkan Hadist Dhaif Dalam Fadhail A’mal: Studi Teoritis Dan Praktis.”
A da'if hadith that is syadid is a very weak hadith, to the extent that its deficiencies cannot be rectified. Another meaning of such a hadith deviates from the conditions of a just narrator or the conditions for protection against syuzuz (narrator's credibility issues). The deficiencies of a syadid al-da'if hadith cannot be rectified in any way, rendering it unusable as evidence.7

The scholars differed in terms of practicing daif hadith. The majority of scholars prefer to practice daif hadiths for Faḍail 'amal by fulfilling three conditions, as explained by Ibn Hajar.8 First, the hadith is not daif jiddan (very weak). Second, the hadith is included in the scope of the main hadith ma’mul (practicable). Third, we don’t believe in certainty when practicing it, but just be careful (ihthiyat).9

Imam Al-Nawawi allows and likes Al-A’mal with weak hadiths. Imam Al-Ala’i believes this can be practiced as long as it benefits the followers and is not considered a Syadid al-da’fi. So Imam Al-Ala’i gave these conditions as conveyed by Ibn Al-Salah and Al-Nawawi, which said: "ma siwa al-maudhu".10

Daif hadiths in the Book of al-Targīb wa al-Tarhib Chapter Ṭahārah

The authors collect the daif hadiths from the chapter, according to al-Hafizh al-Mundzir.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DEGREES OF HADITH</th>
<th>HADITH NUMBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sahih</td>
<td>1, 8, 9, 13, 17, 18, 22, 24, 25, 28, 31, 32, 41, 43, 44, 45, 46, 47, 49, 50, 51, 52, 55, 56, 65, 66, 67, 71, 72, 76, 79, 81, 84, 87, 95, 104, 105, 107, 109, 112, 114, 115, 117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ḥasan</td>
<td>4, 11, 35, 48, 53, 57, 60, 61, 62, 69, 75, 85, 97, 99, 118</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Contradiction Of Using Hujjah With Daif Hadith In Fadail A'mal: Analysis of the Book of Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib

Rafiqatul Anisah, Abdillah Afabih

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Daif</th>
<th>2, 7, 15, 20, 33, 70, 73,</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Without explanation</td>
<td>3, 5, 6, 10, 12, 14, 16, 19, 21, 23, 26, 27, 29, 30, 34, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 42, 54, 58, 59, 63, 64, 68, 74, 77, 78, 80, 83, 86, 88, 89, 90, 91, 92, 93, 94, 96, 98, 100, 101, 102, 103, 106, 110, 111, 113, 116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the results, the authors found 118 hadiths in the taharah chapter from the book al-Targib wa al-Tarhib. Those hadiths have four types according to al-Mundzir: 43 sahih hadiths, 16 hasan hadiths, 7 daif hadiths, and 52 hadiths without any comment.

The 7 daif hadiths have various kinds of daif. In total, 4 hadith is mursal [the first narrator doesn’t meet The Prophet], 2 hadith is majhul [has an unidentified narrator profile], and 1 hadith daif li sū' al-hifzh [has a narrator with a bad skill of memorization]. The first hadith which is from Mu'adz bin Jabal R. A is daif mursal. The second hadith narrated by Makhul R. A, is daif mursal hadith. The third hadith by Ibn Khuzaimah is Daif Majhul hadith. The fourth hadith received from Anas R. A is daif mahfuz mursal. The fifth hadith is from Ibn Abbas R. A, and it is daif mursal. The sixth hadith brought by Ubay bin Ka'ab R. A is daif li sū' al-hifzh. The seventh hadith is from Tsauban R. A, and it is daif majhul.

On the other hand, Shaykh Albani identifies some of those daif
hadith as Ḥāsān ṣaḥīḥ. According to him, the first and the second hadith are Ḥāsān li gairihi. The third, fourth, and seventh hadith is Ṣaḥīḥ li gairihi.

Based on the explanation above, there are 5 disputed hadiths between al-Hafizh al-Mundzir and Shaykh Albani. Those hadiths are called the muḍaʿaf hadith. Whereas 2 hadiths were identified as daif by them, namely the fifth and sixth hadiths.

Therefore, the author wants to know the cause of their difference in those hadiths. As for the takhrīj of each hadith that has been mentioned as follows:

**First Hadith: Sunan Abi Daud**

(24) - [26] حَدَّثَنَا إِسْحَاقُ بْنُ سُوَيْدٍ الزَّرْقَيْيِ، وَعُمَروُّ بْنُ الخَطَابِ أَبُو خَضْصِي، وَحَدِيثَةَ أَمَامَ، أَنَّ سَعِيدَ بْنَ الحُكَمَ حَدَّثَهُمُ، أَحْيَنَا نَافِعَ بْنُ بَرْدَةُ، حَدَّثَنَا حْيَوَةُ بْنُ شَرَْيْحٍ، أَنَّ أَبَا سَعِيدَ الْحُكَمَيِّي حَدَّثَهُ، عَنْ مُعَاذِ بْنِ جَبْلٍ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صلى الله عليه وسلم: " إِنَّ الْمَلَأَ الْثَّلَاثَ: الْبَََازَ فِِ الْمَوارِدِ وَقَارِعَةِ الطَّرِيقِ وَالظِّيْنِ" 11

Shaykh Albani changed the degree of the first mursal hadith to Ṣaḥīḥ li gairihi, whereas based on the results of the author's takhrīj in the book Sunan Abi Daud showed that the sanad was daif because there was one of the sanad which was broken between Amir bin Said al-Hubrani and Mu'ad bin Jabal al-Anshori. Meanwhile, Amir bin Said al-Hubrani is a majhul. The conclusion of the first hadith is majhul. Still, it has risen in rank to Ḥāsān li gairihi because he has a shāhid/supporting hadith narrated by Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal from Abu Hurairah hadith number 8636 with sanad Ḥasan, all of the narrators are Ṣiqaḥ besides al-'Ala' bin Abdurrahman al-Harqy is someone who is considered honest. That is why the sanad turns out to be Ḥasan.

**Second Hadith: al-Marasil Ma’a al-Isnad Li Abi Daud**

---


Al-Bukhari: Jurnal Ilmu Hadis 99 Vol. 6 No.1, Januari – Juni 2023
The second hadith is found in the book al-Marasil Ma'a al-Isnad Li Abi Daud, showing that the sanad is daif because maudhu' irsal while the other narrators are siqah. This hadith is mursal. The scholars differed in their argument with the mursal hadith. According to the majority of scholars, the hadith is mardud (rejected), while according to Imam Abi Hanifah, Imam Malik, and Imam Ahmad, it is valid by requiring a mursal siqah. From this understanding, we can see that it is permissible to argue with the mursal hadith, according to the three priests. And they are prevented by jumhur muhadditsin except for Faḍail al-a’mal.

Third Hadith: Sunan Abi Daud

The third hadith found in the book of Sunan Abi Daud shows that the sanad is daif because there is one of the more advanced sanads, namely Ziyad bin Abi Zahir al-Anshori. The hadith is majhul, but it rises in rank to Ḥasan li gairihi because it becomes a tabi’. Meanwhile, according to the History of Imam al-Hakim from ‘Iyadh from Abi Sa’id al-Khudry stated that Ḥasan was because the narrator was a pure person except for ‘Iyadh, Abdusshomad, and Ikrimah, who were considered honest.

Fourth Hadith: Sunan Daaru Quthni

---

12 Abu Dawud Sulaiman bin Asy’ats bin Ishaq bin Basyir bin Syadad bin ‘Amr al-Azdy Al-Sajistany, Al-Marasil (Beirut: Muassasah al-Risalah, 1408), 73.

13 Al-Sajistany, Sunan Abi Dawud., 1, 4.
Contradiction Of Using Hujjah With Daif Hadith In Fadail A'mal: Analysis of the Book of Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib

Rafiqatul Anisah, Abdillah Afabih

The fourth hadith is contained in the book Sunan ad-Daaru Quthni, which states that the entire sanad of the hadith is daif because Isa bin Mahan ar-Razi was a person who had a bad memory. Therefore, it can be concluded that the hadith is daif, but it has risen in rank to become valid because it became a martyr, as narrated by Imam Ahmad from Abi Hurairah who is a Sīqah.

Fifth Hadith: al–Bahr az–Zukhar bi Musnad al – Barraz

Abu al-Hasan Ali bin Umar bin Ahmad bin Mahdi bin Mas’ud bin al-Nu’man bin Dinar al-Baghdady al-Durarquity, Sunan Al-Durarquity (Beirut: Muassasah al-Risalah, 2004)., 1, 231.


Abu Abdillah Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Hanbal bin Hilal bin Asad Al-Syaibany,
The sixth hadith in Imam Ahmad’s Musnad book shows that the sanad is ḍaīf due to the presence of Ismail bin Abdul Aziz al-Abbasi whose memory is poor. Likewise, Zaid bin al – Hawari al – Ammi also falsified this hadith. The conclusion is that the hadith is ḍaīf and no shāhid or tabi’ confirms it.

**Seventh Hadith: Sunan Ibn Majah**

The seventh hadith in the book of Sunan Ibn Majah shows that the entire sanad is valid because the sanad is muttashil and the narrators are ṣiqah.

Thus the takhrij of the seven ḍaīf hadiths produce three majhul hadiths:

**Maqbul Hadith to Alternate Those Daīf Hadith**

The author has tried to find an alternative for the ḍaīf hadiths. Some alternate hadiths can support the validity of the hadith for faḍail al-a‘mal.

**The Alternate for First Hadith: al-Dārīmī**

**Contradiction Of Using Hujjah With Daif Hadith In Fadail A’mal: Analysis of the Book of Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib**

Rafiqatul Anisah, Abdillah Afabih

---

*Sources*

16 Muhammad bin Hibban bin Ahmad bin Hibban bin Mu’adz bin Ma’bad al-Tamimi Abu Hatim Al-Darimi, Al-Ihsan Fi Taqribi Sahih Ibn Hibban (Beirut: Muassasah al-Risalah, 1988)., 4, 262.


Musnad Al-Imam Ahmad Bin Hanbal (Muassasah al-Risalah, 2001)., 10, 27.
This hadith is considered as supporting hadith (shāhid) for the first hadith. Both of them, contain the derivative word “عن”. This hadith also talks about the same thing [prohibition of defecating/urinating in certain places], although this hadith just mention two of three places from the first hadith.

The Alternate for Third Hadith: al-Hākim

عَنْ عِيَاضٍ، عَنْ أَبِِ سَعِيدٍ الُْْدْرِي ِ، قَالَ: "نَََى رَسُولُ اللََِّّ صلى الله عليه وسلم عَلَى ذَلِكَ ".

This hadith can be an alternative for the third hadith. Both of them talk about the same thing [prohibition of chatting when defecating]

The Alternate for Fourth Hadith: Ahmad

اَنَّ النَّبَِّ صَلَّى اللََُّّ عَلَيْهِ « عَنِ ابْنِ عَبَّاسٍ، وَسَلَّمَ ت َوَضَّأَ مَرَّةً مَرَّةً ».

This hadith and the fourth daif hadith have similarities in terms of the torment of the grave is mainly caused by urine. So, this hadith can substitute the fourth hadith.

The Alternate for Sixth Hadith:

There is no single hadith about faḍilah amal that confirmed the way of wuḍū’ anbiya’ or double reward for washing twice at wuḍū’. Even triple and twice is better than once, but this information doesn’t specify with certain rewards. Therefore, Imam Tirimidzi mention three hadith and say that all of Islamic scholar prefer triple than twice / twice than once.

سنن الترمذي ت شاكر (1/ 60)

عَنْ ابْنِ عَبَّاسٍ، "أَنَّ النَّبِيّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ تَوَضَّأَ مَرَّةً مَرَّةً."

---


20 Al-Syaibany, Musnad Al-Imam Ahmad Bin Hanbal, 14, 76.
Contradiction Of Using Hujjah With Daif Hadith In Faḍail A’mal: Analysis of the Book of Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib

Rafiqatul Anisah, Abdillah Afabih

Conclusion

After explaining and analyzing the hadith daif for Faḍail amal both in terms of cons and pros with an analytical study approach in the book Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib chapter taharah. The author draws the following conclusions:

Syadid al-da’fī is the same as daif jiddan, as we all know that syadid al-da’fī’s deficiencies cannot be patched so that his degree cannot rise to ḥasan li gairihi. As for the hadith daif ghairu syadid, it is one of the requirements of the legal conditions for practicing the hadith daif for Faḍail al-A’mal. If there is a hadith of daif ghairu syadid then it can be filled with daif. The author found two kinds of daif hadiths in the book Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib chapter taharah, mursal, and majhul or jahalah bi al-rawi. The mursal hadith is part of the mardud (rejected) hadith because it is disconnected from the sanads. Whereas jahalah bi al-rawi is part of mardud with the disgraceful cause of a narrator. Both of them are not syadid al-da’fī so their degrees can rise to ḥasan li gairihi and even Saḥīḥ li gairihi. From the daif hadiths in the book Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib chapter taharah, we found maqbul hadiths included in the taharah chapter of the book Saḥīḥ Al-Targib wa al-Tarhib by Imam Albani.
Bibliography


